

No V 25011/276/2009-HR
Government of India
Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
Department of Health Research

Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi
Dated 5th May 2010

ORDER

This order is passed in pursuance of High Court of Allahabad order dated 3.8.2009 in Civil Miscellaneous Writ Petition No. 31904 of 1991, in which the Court has directed that, "the petitioner may file a fresh representation before the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, New Delhi, bringing on record various orders passed by various High Courts and that of the Supreme Court. If such a representation is made with regard to recognition of the course, the authority will consider and decide that matter by a reasoned and speaking order within six months from the date of the production of a certified copy of this order with the representation. If necessary, the petitioner would be accorded personal opportunity of hearing by the respondents".

The NEHM through Dr N K Awasthy filed a representation dated 8.10.2009 before the Secretary, which was received on 31.11.2009. The major issues raised in this representation are as follows:

1. Electropathy is a medical system based on herbal and its medicines are prepared from medicinal plants with the help of distilled water. Its medicines are therefore 100% safe and curative.
2. Not a single complaint/ case has been reported/ registered with the Government regarding death of any patient.
3. There have been various Court judgments supporting electropathy. In support of this contention, the representation has annexed copies of orders relating to these cases.
4. Apart from the Court cases, the representation has also submitted affiliation with World Council, Reports of GE Pant University of Agriculture & Technology, letters from Deputy Minister of Health & Family Welfare dated 14.6.91 & 17.6.91, letter from Government Medical Councils, answers to Parliament questions, notification of directorate of health services, Government of NCT of Delhi, private member bill, letter from former Minister of Health & Family Welfare, article published in the Indian Journal of Veterinary Medicine, Punjab Agricultural Magazine, Ludhiana, Notification of J & K Government and letter of SSP Agra (UP), letter of Government of MP, as well as some publications (books & magazines) on electropathy.
5. Dr Awasthy has represented that the Health Ministry should honour the judgment and give shelter to Electropathy Medical System by permitting NEHM for promotion, development & Research (Education & Practice) in Electropathy Medical System at least initially for 15 years so that the necessary criteria for the recognition of a new medical system may be achieved without any hindrances.

6 The representation was examined in the Ministry. The facts are as follows:

The following orders of the Court have been submitted:

- i) Order dated 14.8.92 within Suit No 27 of 1992 by Additional District Judge, Delhi has directed that No public notice be issued concerning the activity of the plaintiff during the pendency of the suit.
- ii) Order of High Court of Delhi dated November 1998, in FAO No. 1205 of 1998: In public notice it will not be stated that the persons possessing the diploma/ certificates from the respondent No 10 are not entitled to practice Electro Homeopathy system of Medicine.
- iii) Order of Hon'ble Supreme Court made on 12.01.2000 in SLP No/ 11262/2000 (Union of India vs Naturo Electro Homeo Medicose of India):

"Learned counsel for the respondent has pointed out that as per his instructions the order made by the High Court in C.W.P No. 4015/96 to the extent indicated at page 4 of the paper book has been accepted by the petitioners and in view of the matter the impugned direction given by the High court is unexceptionable"

"In view of the order made by us on 12.10.2000 and that no proceedings having been initiated, challenging the order made in the C.W.P No.4015/96, we decline to entertain the matter."

- iv) Order of High Court of Jabalpur, MP: 2957/94 dated 19.3.1999 which essentially stated that the degree/diploma obtained by them are not recognized under any law. The practice in alternative system of medicine is not regulated by any statute & hence in the absence of regulation/ prohibition they cannot be asked to stop practice. No legislation governing practice or teaching in alternate system of medicine has been enacted either by the Union or the State. In this case the MP Government has taken action under the MP Ayurvigyan Parishad Adhiniyam 1990. The Court held that this Act applies only to allopathic system of medicine and also stated that no other law was brought to the notice of the Court. So long as a valid law is not made regulating this branch, therefore stopping the petitioners from practicing in alternative system of medicine or imparting education is illegal.

- v) Order of High Court of Madhya Pradesh at Jabalpur bench, Gwalior in WP No 2462/08 in which directions were given that orders in WP 2957/94 shall apply.

Apart from the above, Letter D.O. No. 2921/ DM (H&FW)91/VIP dated 17.6.1991 from Dāsai Chowdhry, Deputy Minister of Health & Family Welfare to Shri Jagannath Singh, MP has been annexed, which states that:

"I have authorized N E H M of INDIA for the Development Promotion & Research of electropathy in India"

The Government of India issued an Order No. R. 14015/25/96-U & H(R) (pt) dated 25th November 2003, based on the recommendations of a "Standing Committee of Experts" under the chairmanship of Director General ICMR, set up by the Government of India. Based on the recommendations of the Committee, the Government of India has given the following orders:

The committee did not recommend recognition to alternative medicines except Ayurveda, Siddha, Unani, Homeopathy & Yoga & Naturopathy which were found to fulfill the essential & desirable criteria developed by the Committee for recognition of a system of medicine.

The Committee further recommended that all systems of medicine not recognized as separate systems should not be allowed to continue full time Bachelor and Masters degrees and the term doctor should be used only by practitioners of systems of medicine recognized by Government of India. Those considered as mode of therapy can be conducted as certificate courses for registered medical practitioners.

The Committee, however, recommended that certain practices as Acupuncture which qualified as modes of therapy, could be allowed to be practised by registered practitioners or appropriately trained personnel.

The Committee, based on the essential & desirable criteria, did not find electropathy to qualify as a system of medicine. Therefore, it is clear that, in accordance with this order, electropathy cannot run full time Bachelor and Masters degrees and those practicing this cannot use the term "doctor".

NEHM, as per the document submitted by them is conducting diploma and certificate courses, and not running full time Bachelor and Masters degrees.

In so far as recognizing the courses run by them, it is clarified that the concerned boards/statutory bodies like the Medical Council, give recognition to courses. Since electropathy is not recognized as a system of medicine, there is no system for recognition of any course run by them in the Health Ministry.

NEHM, has also not submitted any document according to which they fulfill the essential & desirable criteria developed by the Committee for recognition of a system of medicine.

However, the Order No. R. 14015/25/96-U & H(R) (pt) dated 25th November 2003, does not bar the Development & Research of Electropathy

In accordance with Orders of the High Court & Supreme Court quoted here, there is no proposal to stop the petitioners from practicing in electropathy or imparting education, as long as this is done within the provision of the Order No. R 14015/25/96-U & H (R) (Pt) dated 25th November 2003. Once the legislation to recognize new systems of medicine is enacted, any practice or education would be regulated in accordance with the said Act. The representation of the petitioner dated 28.10.2009 is disposed off accordingly.

This issues with the approval of Secretary, Department of Health Research in this Ministry.

(MOHD. SALEEM)
Under Secretary to the Government of India of India
Tel No.23061986

To

N. E. H. M. of India, H.O. C-2 C/123, Pocket 12, Janak Puri, New Delhi - 110058.

Copy for information and necessary action to:

1. Shri Ravi Bhushan Singhal, Assistant Solicitor General of India, 200, Lukerganj, Allahabad. (U.P)
2. Shri Ravi Bhushan Singhal, Assistant Solicitor General of India, High Court of Allahabad, Allahabad. (U.P)

(MOHD. SALEEM)
Under Secretary to the Government of India of India